



Full length article

Ocean acidification weakens the immune response of blood clam through hampering the NF-kappa β and toll-like receptor pathways



Saixi Liu^a, Wei Shi^a, Cheng Guo^a, Xinguo Zhao^a, Yu Han^a, Chao Peng^a, Xueliang Chai^b, Guangxu Liu^{a,*}

^a School of Agriculture and Biotechnology, Zhejiang University, Hangzhou, China
^b School of Life Sciences, Zhejiang University, Hangzhou, China

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:
 Received 31 January 2016
 Received in revised form
 14 April 2016
 Accepted 20 April 2016
 Available online 22 April 2016

Keywords:
 Ocean acidification
 Immune response
 Blood clam
 NF-kappa β signaling pathway
 Toll-like receptor pathway

ABSTRACT

The impact of CO₂ driven ocean acidification on marine bivalve immunity remains poorly understood. To date, this impact has only been investigated in a few bivalve species and the underlying molecular mechanism remains unknown. In the present study, the effects of the realistic future ocean CO₂ levels (pH at 8.1, 7.8, and 7.4) on the total number of haemocyte cells (THC), phagocytosis status, blood cell types composition, and expression levels of twelve genes from the NF-kappa β signaling and toll-like receptor pathways of a typical bottom burrowing bivalve, blood clam (*Tresus nutalli*), were investigated. The results obtained showed that while both THC number and phagocytosis frequency were significantly reduced, the percentage of red and basophil granulocytes were significantly decreased and increased, respectively, upon exposure to elevated CO₂. In addition, exposure to CO₂ acidified seawater generally led to a significant down-regulation in the inducer and key response genes of NF-kappa β signaling and toll-like receptor pathways. The results of the present study revealed that ocean acidification may hamper immune responses of the bivalve *T. nutalli*, which subsequently render individuals more susceptible to pathogens attacks such as those from virus and bacteria.

© 2016 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

Ocean takes up about 25% of the emitted anthropogenic atmospheric CO₂, moderating CO₂-driven climate change while leading to ocean acidification [1,2]. The absorption of CO₂ in the water column triggers a series of chemistry changes, including a reduction in calcium carbonate (CaCO₃) saturation and an increase in [H⁺] [1]. According to the prediction by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), the pH of surface seawater has decreased by 0.1 units compared with that before the industrial revolution and will decrease by 0.3–0.4 units by the end of 21st century [3,4]. It has been shown that ocean acidification exert significant impacts on a variety of marine organisms, especially calcifiers [5]. As a consequence, the adaptability of marine organisms to ocean acidification is crucial for their survivor and well-being [2,6].

Exposed to a complex environment, bivalves in the marine ecosystem are often challenged by various pathogenic microorganisms [7]. Therefore, maintaining a sound immunity is crucial for survival [8]. For bivalves, the immune strategy mainly depends on innate defense from haemocytes and humoral factors [8]. It has been shown that CO₂ driven ocean acidification can lead to a significant alteration in both total haemocyte count and cell type composition in *T. nutalli*, indicating a reduced immunity of this bivalve species under near future ocean acidification scenarios [11]. Similarly, it has been found that exposure to elevated seawater CO₂ led to a significant decline in the antibacterial activity of cell-free haemolymph of the *T. nutalli* [10] and rendered the blue mussel *Mytilus edulis* more susceptible to pathogen infection [7,13]. Although it has been suggested that ocean acidification may affect the physiological condition and function of the haemocytes of *T. nutalli*, and therefore may impact the immune-related cellular signaling pathways [9], the molecular mechanism underneath remains elusive.

Unlike *T. nutalli* and *Mytilus edulis*, which produce byssal threads that attach to each other and/or hard substances, the blood clam (*T. nutalli*, Linnaeus 1758) is a typical bottom-burrowing

* Corresponding author. Room 551, Agriculture-Environment-Biology Group, Zijingang Campus, Zhejiang University, 866# Yuhangtang Road, Hangzhou, Zhejiang 310058, PR China.

E-mail address: guangxu_liu@zju.edu.cn (G. Liu).

bivalve that lives in intertidal mudflats. The blood clam distributes widely throughout the Indo-Pacific region from the eastern coast of South Africa northwards and eastwards to Southeast Asia, Australia, Polynesia, and up to northern Japan [14]. It is an important aquaculture species that also plays a crucial ecological role in the coastal ecosystem [15].

In order to obtain a better understanding on the impact of ocean acidification on the immunity of marine bivalves and the underlying molecular mechanisms, the effects exerted on total haemocyte counts, haemocyte cell type composition, phagocytosis status, and the expressions of twelve genes from the virus infection-induced NF-kappa β signaling and the microbial pathogens-induced toll-like receptor signaling pathways were analyzed in the present study.

2. Methods

2.1. Adult *T. granosa*

Adult *T. granosa* with a shell height at 18.17 ± 1.65 mm were collected from Qingjiang, Wenzhou, Zhejiang province of China in August 2014. Experimental samples were kept in a 2000 L indoor tank with 1500 L filtered 24 h aerated seawater (temperature at 24.0 ± 0.2 °C, pH at 8.10 ± 0.02 , salinity at 20.78 ± 0.31 ‰, and dissolved oxygen at 7.98 ± 0.30 mg/L) for a week before the commencement of experiment. Following the methods described by Shi and Peng [16,17], blood clams were fed with microalgae *Chlorella* twice a day and half the volume of the seawater in each tank was replaced daily during the acclimation period.

2.2. Experimental design and seawater parameters

Following the methods described by Riebesell [18], blood clams were exposed to the present and two predicted CO₂ levels with a carbon dioxide and air mixing system by bubbling pure air or air-carbon dioxide mixture into the 40 L experimental seawater. The ambient seawater at pH 8.1 was employed as the control and seawater at pH 7.8 and pH 7.4 as predicted by the IPCC to occur at 2100 and 2300 respectively [3,4] were used for the experimental trials. To ensure consistency in the seawater chemistry parameters in each trial throughout experiment, pH_{NBS}, salinity, temperature and total alkalinity (TA) were monitored daily (Table 1). The pH_{NBS} of each level was measured by a pH meter (PB-10, Sartorius) calibrated with NBS standard buffers. Salinity was determined using a conductivity meter (Multi 3410 WTW, Germany). Water temperature was measured with a mercury thermometer. Total alkalinity (TA) was obtained by potentiometric titration [19]. The carbonate system parameters were calculated from the measured pH_{NBS}, salinity, temperature, and TA values using the open-source program CO2SYS [20], with the constants supplied by Mehrbach [21] and refitted by Dickson and Millero [22] and the KSO₄ dissociation constant from Dickson [23]. In total, one hundred blood clam individuals were used for each experimental trial.

Table 1

Seawater parameters during the one-week incubation of *T. granosa* (mean \pm SE). Partial pressure of CO₂, dissolved inorganic carbon, and saturation state of aragonite and calcite were calculated from measured pH_{NBS}, salinity, temperature, and TA values using the open-source program CO2SYS. T: temperature; Sal: salinity; TA: total alkalinity; CO₂: CO₂ partial pressure; DIC: dissolved inorganic carbon; Ω ara: aragonite saturation state; and Ω cal: calcite saturation state.

Target pH	T (°C)	Sal (‰)	pH _{NBS}	TA (μmol/kg)	CO ₂ (μatm)	DIC (μmol/kg)	Ω ara	Ω cal
8.1	23.9 \pm 0.2	20.83 \pm 0.25	8.10 \pm 0.03	2074.77 \pm 11.55	549.63 \pm 2.86	1933.21 \pm 18.45	1.97 \pm 0.01	3.17 \pm 0.02
7.8	24.0 \pm 0.1	20.66 \pm 0.21	7.78 \pm 0.02	2092.65 \pm 7.33	1187.72 \pm 6.01	2044.56 \pm 13.33	1.06 \pm 0.01	1.71 \pm 0.01
7.4	24.0 \pm 0.3	20.87 \pm 0.21	7.41 \pm 0.03	2062.17 \pm 17.32	3064.16 \pm 27.21	2122.46 \pm 31.18	0.44 \pm 0.01	0.70 \pm 0.01

2.3. Haemocyte count analysis

A haemocyte count analysis was carried out following the method of Zhu [24] and Mackenzie [13]. After a period of 14 days raised in the various experimental conditions, five individuals were randomly taken out of each trial for the total haemocyte counts analysis. The shell surface of the experimental blood clams was rinsed with a 0.1 M phosphate buffer saline (PBS, pH at 7.4) solution to remove impurities. After that, haemolymph was extracted out of the cavity from each individual using a 2 mL syringe.

After diluting 100 μ L haemolymph with 800 μ L PBS, 100 μ L 2.5% glutaraldehyde was added to fix the haemolymph. A wet mount of the fixed haemolymph was made with Neubauer haemocytometer (XB-K-25, Anxin Optical Instrument) and was subsequently observed under Nikon eclipse E600 microscopy at a magnification of 1000 \times to estimate the total haemocyte counts.

For haemocyte cell type analysis, four individuals were taken out randomly from each trial. A mixture of 700 μ L haemolymph and 300 μ L 2.5% glutaraldehyde was used to determine the counts of differential cell types. After keeping at room temperature (24 °C) for 1 min, the haemolymph mixture was centrifuged at 4000 rpm for 4 min. A blood smear was then made with 50 μ L of blood precipitate. Once air dried, the smear was stained with Wright's stain (G1020, Solarbio), following the instructions provided with the reagent. The counts of various cell types were then obtained under a Nikon eclipse E600 light microscope at 1000 \times magnification. A total of more than 100 haemocyte cells for each sample were scored.

2.4. Phagocytosis assays

Phagocytosis assays were carried out following the method of Cima [25] with minor modifications. Yeast (Instant dry yeast, AngelYeast) suspensions were prepared by dissolving 7 mg yeast powder in 1000 μ L 0.1 M PBS. After having been reared in each experimental trial (pH at 8.1, 7.8, and 7.4 respectively) for two weeks, 100 μ L haemolymph was extracted from the individual using the same method as described above and proceeded to phagocytosis assays. A volume of 100 μ L haemolymph was mixed with 100 μ L Alsever's solution (ALS, Noble Ryder) in a 1.5 mL centrifuge tube followed by the addition of 20 μ L yeast suspension to the haemolymph mixture. The assays were first kept at room temperature (25 °C) for 30 min followed by incubating in a cool water bath at 4 °C for an hour. After that 100 μ L 2.5% glutaraldehyde was added and blood smears were made and subsequently stained with Wright's stain. The phagocytic rate was estimated microscopically at 1000 \times with a Nikon eclipse E600 light microscope. Five individuals from each trial and more than 100 haemocyte cells for each individual were scored.

2.5. RNA extraction and RT-PCR

After having been reared in various acidified seawater for 28 days, RNA was extracted from haemocytes samples using Trizol (Invitrogen, USA) following the protocol provided. The presence of

contaminating genomic DNA was removed by RQ1 RNase-Free DNase (Promega, USA). The concentration and quality of the extracted RNA were verified with NanoDrop 1000 UV/visible spectrophotometer (Thermo Scientific) and gel electrophoresis. Two micrograms high-quality total RNA was reversely transcribed into First strand cDNA using M-MLV First Strand Kit (Invitrogen, C28025-032).

In total, the expressions of twelve immune-related genes were analyzed, including the retinoic acid-inducible gene 1 (RIG-I), tripartite motif-containing protein 25 (TRIM25), TNF receptor-associated factor 2 (TRAF2), mitogen activated protein kinase 7 (TAK1), TAK1-binding protein 2 (TAB2), and the inhibitor of nuclear factor kappa- β kinase subunit alpha (IKK α) in the virus infection induced NF-kappa β pathway and genes of toll-like receptors (TLR1, TLR2, TLR4, TLR5, TLR6) and the downstream myeloid differentiation primary response protein MyD88 (MyD88) in the toll-like receptor signaling pathway. Primers for the genes under investigation and the reference 18S rRNA are listed in Table 2. All primers were synthesized by Sangon Biotech (Shanghai, China).

The qPCR was performed using a CFX 96TM Real-Time System (Bio-Rad) with a 10 μ L reaction system, containing 5 μ L AceQTM qPCR SYBR Green Master Mix (Vazyme, China), 0.5 μ L primer (10 μ M each), 3 μ L double-distilled water, and 1 μ L cDNA template. The qPCR cycles consisted of initial denaturation at 95 °C for 5 min, 39 amplification cycles at 95 °C for 20 s, 61 °C for 20 s, and 72 °C for 20 s. The melting curve analysis (MCA) was used to confirm the specificity and reliability of the PCR products. The $2^{-\Delta\Delta CT}$ method was applied to analyze the relative expression of the twelve genes investigated.

2.6. t t t

One-way ANOVAs followed by Tukey's post hoc tests were

Table 2
Primers sequences for the 12 immune-related genes and the internal reference 18S rRNA (F and R after the dash line in the primer name indicate former primer and reverse primer, respectively).

Primers	Sequence (5'–3')	Accession no.
a. internal reference 18S rRNA		
18 -F	CITTCAAATGCTGCCCTATCAACT	JN974506.1
18 -R	TCCCCTATTGTTATTTTCGTCACT	
b. genes out of NF-kappa β signaling pathway		
- -F	CAGGATCGTGTAGTTGAGG	JZ898320
- -R	TGTGAGTGAGCATGTTAAGA	
A 2-F	CGTAATAGAAGAGCCGATCA	JZ898323
A 2-R	GCGAATAGATACTGGTCACT	
25-F	CGTAATAGAAGAGCCGATCA	JZ898324
25-R	GCGAATAGATACTGGTCACT	
A 1-F	C GACTCTGTTGATTACTCTC	JZ898322
A 1-R	CATTGTAAGTTGGCTCAAGA	
AB2-F	CCACCAAGAATCCACCAT	JZ898321
AB2-R	TCCGAGCAITTCACACTTA	
α -F	ATATTGTGCTGGTGGAGATT	JZ898319
α -R	GCTTCAGATCACGGTGTATA	
c. genes out of Toll-like receptor pathway		
1-F	TTCGTCTTCATCTGCGTAT	JZ898313
1-R	CAATGAGCATCTTCGTATCG	
2-F	CAACTCGTCTCGTGCAA	JZ898314
2-R	GACTCTCCAGTATTCTCTATCA	
4-F	CAATGAGCATCTTCGTATCG	JZ898315
4-R	TTCGTCTTCATCTGCGTAT	
5-F	TTAAGCGCAATCGTCTG	JZ898316
5-R	GAGAGTGTACTGAGGCAAT	
6-F	CGAACAGCGAGAGTTACT	JZ898317
6-R	TCATCTTCAGGCGTTAATTG	
88-F	AAGGAACAATGCCACT	JZ898318
88-R	GGTCAAGTTCATCGTCAG	

conducted to compare haemocyte counts, phagocytosis, and the percentage of three major types of haemocytes subjected to various

CO₂ trials using the statistical package "R". T-tests were performed to compare the expression level of each gene against control. A p -value less than 0.05 was accepted as a statistically significant difference for all analysis.

3. Results

3.1. t t t t t t t t t t

As shown in Table 3, compared to the average THC (7.61×10^6 cells/mL) of the control groups, ocean acidification led to a significant decrease in the average THC (ANOVA, $p < 0.05$), which were 6.45×10^6 and 5.33×10^6 cells/mL for the CO₂ elevated trials at pH 7.8 and pH 7.4, respectively. Following the method described by Zhu [24], based on cell sizes, granular types, and the microstructure of cells, three major types of haemocytes were identified in blood clams including red granulocyte, basophil granulocyte, and hyalinocyte. In comparison to that of the control groups, the haemocytes of the blood clams reared in acidified seawater showed significantly fewer red granulocytes but a higher proportion of basophil granulocytes (ANOVA, $p < 0.05$). Similarly, compared to that of the control, CO₂ driven seawater acidification led to a significant decrease in phagocytosis. This was reflected in a drop of about seven-tenth and four-fifth of that of the control for the acidified groups at pH 7.8 and pH 7.4, respectively, after two weeks in CO₂ acidified seawater.

3.2. t t t t t t t t t t

As shown in Fig. 1, compared to that of the control, severe ocean acidification (pH at 7.4) generally led to a significant reduction in the expression of all genes tested except for TLR2 whose expression was shown to be significantly induced. In moderate CO₂ acidified seawater (pH at 7.8) for 28 days, only the expression of TLR2 and TLR6 were significantly depressed while the expressions of TLR1, TLR4, TLR5, and the downstream MYD88 were not significantly different from that of the control groups (Fig. 1).

3.3. t t t t t t t t t t

Compared to that of the control groups, severe ocean acidification (pH at 7.4) led to a significant reduction in the expression of RIG-I, TAK1 and IKK α genes whereas the expression of the TRAF2 gene was shown to be significantly induced (Fig. 2). The expression of RIG-I and TAK1 were significantly depressed while those of TRIM25, TRAF2 and TAB2 were significantly induced in moderate CO₂ acidified seawater (pH at 7.8) trials. The expression of IKK α of clams exposed to moderate ocean acidification was not significantly different from that of the control.

4. Discussion

In accordance to the results reported by Zhu [24] and Söderhäll [26], three major types of haemocytes, red granulocyte, basophil granulocyte, and hyalinocyte were identified in , among which the red granulocyte has been predicted to have the highest phagocytic activity. Therefore, the ocean acidification-induced reduction detected in phagocytosis may be due to a reduction in both the total haemocyte counts and the proportional number of red granulocytes.

four weeks of elevated CO₂ seawater, suggesting a weakened response system against gram negative bacteria and bacteria flagellum. On the other hand, the depression of TLR1 and TLR6 and the downstream MYD88 under acidified oceanic conditions render the clam a weakened response against gram positive bacteria.

Unlike bacteria, viral pathogens mainly induce innate antiviral responses through the NF-kappa β signaling pathway [32,33]. Intracellular double-stranded RNA (dsRNA), a main replication indication for many viruses, activates the cytosolic viral RNA receptor RIG-I [34] and subsequently the downstream TRAF2/6, TAK1, TAB2, and IKK α [35,36] under the regulation of TRIM25 [37]. The data obtained in the present study showed that elevated CO₂ had significant impacts on the NF-kappa β signaling pathway of blood clams. The expression of the gene RIG-I and its downstream response gene IKK α in the NF-kappa β signaling pathway were significantly down-regulated in elevated CO₂ trials, indicating that ocean acidification may render blood clam individuals more susceptible to viral infections.

Ocean acidification may weaken the immunity of a bivalve species such as blood clams via both direct and indirect routes. Since bivalves are generally considered to have limited abilities to regulate the haemolymph acid-base balance [38,39], ocean acidification may bring about hypercapnic in bivalves [40] and subsequently directly affect physiological activities such as immune responses [41]

Upon pathogen challenge, specific immune response via the toll-like receptor and NF-kappa β signal pathways would be activated [27]. Members of the toll-like receptor (TLRs) play critical roles in the innate immune system, which can be activated by conserved microbial structures and subsequently induce a core set of immune responses by activating MyD88-dependent pathways [28,29]. In general, gram positive bacteria, gram negative bacteria, and the bacteria flagellum invasion can specifically stimulate TLR2, TLR4, and TLR5, respectively [30,31]. Furthermore, the gram positive bacteria-induced TLR2 responses rely on cooperation with TLR1 or TLR6 [30]. In the present study, gene expression of TLR4, TLR5 and MYD88 were all significantly depressed when exposed to

internal ion regulation. For instance, a study showed that blue mussels,

- Sydney rock oyster *Saccostrea glomerata* (Gould 1850), *Glob. Change Biol.* 15 (2009) 2123–2136.
- [44] F. Gazeau, J.P. Gattuso, C. Dawber, et al., Effect of ocean acidification on the early life stages of the blue mussel *Mytilus edulis*, *Biogeosciences* 7 (2010) 2051–2060.
- [45] T.G. Evans, P. Watson-Wynn, Effects of seawater acidification on gene expression: resolving broader-scale trends in sea urchins, *Biol. Bull.* 226 (2014) 237–254.
- [46] D.A. Roberts, S.N.R. Birchenough, C. Lewis, et al., Ocean acidification increases the toxicity of contaminated sediments, *Glob. Change Biol.* 19 (2013) 340–351.
- [47] F. Gazeau, C. Quiblier, J.M. Jansen, et al., Impact of elevated CO₂ on shellfish calcification, *Geophys. Res. Lett.* 34 (2007) L07603.
- [48] V. Witt, C. Wild, K. Anthony, et al., Effects of ocean acidification on microbial community composition of, and oxygen fluxes through, biofilms from the Great Barrier Reef, *Environ. Microbiol.* 13 (2011) 2976–2989.
- [49] S. Akira, K. Takeda, Toll-like receptor signalling, *Nat. Rev. Immunol.* 4 (2004) 499–511.